

Innovation in ELT: Multiliteracies Pedagogy for Enhancing Critical Thinking Skills in the 21st Century

by Erma Nuroh

Submission date: 09-Mar-2023 10:38AM (UTC+0700)

Submission ID: 2032668687

File name: T_Multiliteracies_Pedagogy_for_Enhancing_Critical_TELL_2020.pdf (175.01K)

Word count: 4609

Character count: 26843

Innovation in ELT: Multiliteracies Pedagogy for Enhancing Critical Thinking Skills in the 21st Century

Ermawati Z Nuroh*
Universitas Muhammadiyah Sidoarjo, Indonesia
ermawati.19008@mhs.unesa.ac.id
*Corresponding Author

Ahmad Munir
Doctorate Program Language and Literature Education, Universitas Negeri Surabaya, 60231, Indonesia
ahmadmunir@unesa.ac.id

Pratiwi Retnaningdyah
Doctorate Program Language and Literature Education, Universitas Negeri Surabaya, 60231, Indonesia
pratiwiretnaningdyah@unesa.ac.id

Oikurema Purwati
Doctorate Program Language and Literature Education, Universitas Negeri Surabaya, 60231, Indonesia
Pungki_unesa@yahoo.co.id

Article History

Received: 20 Juni 2020
Reviewed: 20 Juli 2020
Accepted: 26 Agustus 2020
Published: 1 September 2020

Highlights

the implementation of the multiliteracies pedagogy models is one of the alternative learning models that can improve critical thinking and problem-solving students

6
ABSTRACT: The problem with this research is the lack of skills and thinking skills of humane education in the twenty-first century, especially of critical thinking and problem-solving. It is caused by several factors, one of the main factors is, learning that has not been oriented to the development of the twenty-first-century thinking skills and still only focuses on achieving partial-textual knowledge and not on the integrative-contextual understanding of the knowledge learned. In line with this, it takes an effort to improve the critical thinking skills of Indonesian education. The effort should be initiated by engineering the appropriate education model and on target, one of which is multiliteracies pedagogy. This research was conducted using the literature study discussing multiliteracies pedagogy to enhancing critical thinking skills in the twenty-first century. Literature review refers to a written synthesis of journal articles, books, and other documents that summarizes and critiques the past and current state of information about a topic, organizes the literature into sub-topics, and documents the background for a study. It can be concluded that the implementation of the multiliteracies pedagogy models is one of the alternative learning models that can improve critical thinking and problem-solving students in the university effectively in the areas of study taught compared to the most direct models used in English Language Teaching (ELT). Therefore, it is advisable to implement multiliteracies pedagogy in the practice of learning activities. Also, the application of multiliteracies pedagogy should be supported by the cooperation of all elements, both between teachers, management, and parents. This needs to be done to realize the effectiveness of quality learning, thus giving implications on the growth of potential students.

Keywords: Multiliteration Pedagogy, Critical thinking skills, English Language Teaching.

Introduction

The twenty-first century is a century of changing times characterized by the advancement of science and technology that implicates the increasingly complex changes in life. This will also affect the existence of an increasingly competitive life order, so it is necessary to develop the quality of human resources as a whole, whether ability and skills are owned, to increase the competitiveness of strong and superior to compete in the world without borders. Besides, human resources also need to be oriented to the efforts to build a critical awareness of the life that needs to be held in cultural values (both participatory and universal). This is by the opinion of Freire (2008) which reveals that a time is always characterized by the complexity of issues, ideas, concepts, hopes, and challenges in dialectical interactions formulate completion.

In connection with the above, the efforts to increase human resources can be done in the education sector² as an effort to build a new civilization in the dynamics of life progressively. Therefore, education must be able to improve the quality of learners to be creative, innovative, adaptable, competitive, and skillful in facing fast globalized schools and workplaces (Mills, 2006). Learners essentially require high-level creativity to learn how to read and write multimodal texts which are integrated into other modes of language (Cope & Kalantzis, 2009). They need interactive and informative multimodalities with the advanced technological setting where information comes from various sources with different patterns (Boling, 2008).

In line with this, globally enhancement students' skills and ability⁴ to integrate the twenty-first-century skills are known as the 4Cs term, consisting of communication, collaboration, creativity, and critical thinking. This 4Cs skill is a manifestation of four of the learning pillars created by UNESCO in 1996 namely learning to know, learning to do, learning to be, and learning to live together. The twenty-first-century skills should be performed as early as possible by revitalizing education so that education can exercise its role to give birth to educate people who possess the skills of the twenty-first century. Also, education should be a means to build a civilization based on the cultural values of Indonesia. This is in line with the opinion of Al Muchtar (2001:296) which reveals that to put education as a cultural aspect and to seek alternative dissolution based on cultural analytical thinking, in answer to the intrinsic value of education as part of the culture.

In the education of university levels, in particular, in the English Department, the reasons why college students in universities are frequently ineffective in changing thoughts and writing in English critically due to the fact of the lack of meaningful activities, and the limited use of critical thinking skills are affected. Especially, with the latest news of corruption, politics, and education, they tend to agree on opinions barring evaluating them appropriately. It is likely because most of them before studying at foremost and secondary faculties put on a teacher-centered approach. Hence, expressing ideas in English each communicative and critically is no longer effortless for students in the English department⁵.

Within the multiliteracies framework, students draw on available designs (for example, the linguistic information in a book) to design (make meaning and create) a redesigned (transformed) multimodal text (Kalantzis & Cope, 2005). Multimodal texts are texts that combine two or more communication modes (e.g., print, image, music, film,

etc.) or semiotic systems (e.g. linguistic, visual, audio, gestural, spatial) to enhance or transform the meaning of a text (Anstey & Bull, 2010). Oriented to the efforts to develop the thinking of skills in the twenty-first century, especially the high-level of thinking skills that include: critical thinking, problem-solving, creative and metacognition on the higher education level in Indonesia. Therefore, the Multiliteracies pedagogy is one of the concepts of education (theoretical) which has proved to be an educational concept that can develop the skills of thinking in the twenty-first century.

Based on what has been discussed above, the writer will focus on presenting how critical thinking skills and meaning should be implemented in English Language Teaching through multiliteracies pedagogy. To begin with, the writer will first discuss English Language Teaching in Indonesia in general perspectives and then explain the reasons why critical thinking skills and meaning should be prioritized in English classes.

From this point on, the writer will suggest practical teaching stages incorporating critical thinking skills and meaning in an English lesson.

Methodology

This study is the result of a synthesis of the literature study discussing multiliteracies in enhancing critical thinking skills in the twenty-first century in English language teaching, critical thinking skills in the university, and multiliteracies in critical thinking skills for English language teaching. The literature study used in this study is reputable international journals and books obtained through Google Scholar, Proquest, and Eric (Educational Research Informational Center) website searches. The definition of the analytical study used in this research is the study of the libraries submitted by Clark & Cresswell (2010) stating that "literature review refers to a written synthesis of journal articles, books, and other documents that summarizes and critiques the past and current state of information about a topic, organizes the literature into sub-topics, and documents the background for a study". Even, Mann emphasized that library research is a research model that comprises of at least 6 corresponding keys (Mann, 1993). These are keyword searches, subject searches, probe for recent scholarly articles, books or publication, citation searches, searches of direct people source, as well as systematic browsing. Researchers regarded this model as one of the appropriate approaches in answering this paper question. There are 5 (five) recent articles that were published under a similar concern of multiliteracies pedagogy in critical thinking skills. The first paper entitled "Critical thinking skills and meaning in English Language Teaching", authored by Harits Masduqi (2011). The second paper entitled "The importance of multiliteracies for students of primary school teachers in preparation of curriculum 2013", author by Esti Untari (2017). The third article entitled "ELT in Indonesia Context: Issues and Challenges" author by Rahmat Yusny (2013). The fourth article entitled "The Pedagogy of English as an International Language (EIL): More Reflections and Dialogues", author by R. Marlina and R.A. Giri (2014). The last source is from Mary Kalantzis and William Cope (2008), under the titled "Language Education and Multiliteracies".

Literature Review

English Language Teaching (ELT)

At the university level, the English curriculum is nevertheless relevant and still implied in the latest competence primarily based curriculum. The competence-based total study of English at Indonesian universities has equal characteristics with communicative language teaching. The contemporary approach wishes flexible and independent learning, for instance: the capacity to state one's choice or intention in base competence studying is closely comparable to that in communicative language teaching. Furthermore, in each approach, learning outcomes are determined, formed, and evaluated as discrete elements of size within unique contexts and situations (Marcellino, 2008).

The problems of English language teaching at the university level are plentiful in Indonesia. One of the fundamental problems is invisible the usage of English outside the classroom. It is challenging for the students to get motivated when they do no longer experience without delay to use English for communication outside the class. A tough idea to apprehend for most students is studying how to talk mastery in English because they do sincerely not get used to talking English in their everyday interactions.

Another problem is that Indonesian lecturers do no longer have adequate possibilities to do research or even seize up the updated information about English language instructing regularly. As a result, their educational skills are no longer most fulfilling and might misread the competence-based learning or to practice of communicative language teaching. At worst, the lecturers regularly have to teach productive skills (writing and speaking) in large classes which is full of students with exceptional competence.

The following problem is cultural. One of the essential features of the communicative approach in competence-based learning is learner-centered learning. In this case, there must be a dedication that consists of the objectives, content, and progress of learning, methods, techniques. And evaluation, which supports learner autonomy (Dardjowidjojo, 1997). Alike in perspective, Richards and Rodgers (2002) argue that the English language instructing in the classroom-based totally on a communicative approach should be students centered and suitable for the students' needs and interests. This approach is doubtlessly useful in western countries the place humans think about egalitarianism and democracy. However, the thought is nearly impractical in Indonesia, especially because student-teacher relations are closely influenced using local wisdom and cultural values.

The college students from rural areas are strongly influenced by using the Javanese tradition, they are not accustomed to student-centered learning activities. For example, two well-known Javanese philosophies such as "*manut lan piturut*" (to obey and to follow) and "*ewuh-pakewuh*" (feeling uncomfortable and uneasy) nevertheless dominantly exist by way of the Indonesian people's way of thinking. The Javanese cultural ideas provide affected the college students to follow their lectures' thoughts barring evaluating or examining them before. Even, they contradict with the lecture's idea, they tend to be quiet, even they be given the whole thing what the lecture says. As a result, it is no longer effortless to assume college students to speak and engage freely and critically with their lectures.

Unfortunately, the lecturers are now not paid properly because they get a low salary, and most of them doing the side job to get an extra income. This is a serious condition, due to the fact it can make the lecturers are less promoted in their predominant

job is teaching. Even, most of them are no longer involved in conducting a lookup or follow up on professional development because of no direct income from such types of academic struggle.

In short, the emphasis in the contemporary curriculum to clearly show an understanding of the contemporary approach in teaching English how it positions of language teaching in the context of foreign languages. However, in truth generally, the proper ideas are no longer well translated into an exercise in the classroom. This is induced by using aiding conditions such as the existence or model of true language, much publicity to language in real lifestyles situations and the involvement of critical thinking assignments is now not apparent in English language teaching in Indonesia” (Dardjowidjojo, 1997; Musthafa, 2001; Sukono, 2004; Marcellino, 2008). Consequently to altering instructing methods and strategy the government and educators should locate innovative ways to clear up the problems or to create a conducive atmosphere for practicing of communicative techniques that are greater ideal in teaching English

Critical Thinking Skills

Today, education at university, many lecturers sound off that the students do no longer use their critical thinking competencies sufficiently when they are doing both oral and written assignments. Based on the educating experiences at the English Department, the writer regularly finds students do not enthusiastic to change ideas seriously and tend to accept experts’ ideas barring examining them properly. It likely occurs due to the fact of the students did now not observe the learner based approach and did now not improve students’ critical thinking skills optimally when they studied in senior high schools. Concerning on a similar problem, Cromwell (1992) states that the fundamental purpose of advanced education is the enhancement of student thinking. This is in line with today’s challenge that most graduates at all education levels do now not perform higher thinking abilities.

The government has nationally carried out the communicative approach at the university level. This curriculum is claimed will be finer in enhancing students’ academic, life, and thinking skills. But English lectures’ teaching has now not modified significantly, even though the curriculum is changed. The way of teaching is nevertheless a teacher-centered and offers more often than not with complex grammar, long reading passages, and other things to do that are far from the actual purpose of the latest curriculum. Consequently, students are not given enough opportunities to do meaningful collaborative tasks in which they should discuss, share, and assignment the ideas communicatively and critically (Sukono, 2004; Masduqi, 2008).

It suggests that there is any inconsistency between the concepts of the curriculum and the implementation of classroom activities which is nonetheless dominated by using the teacher center. No wonder, the university students nevertheless have difficulties in revealing ideas in English communicatively and critically. Critical thinking skills will be developed optimally if it is dealt with as the priority in English lessons and it can be applied when teachers do collaborative activities (pair work and teamwork) which stimulate students’ thinking process in their classroom discussions.

Multiliteracies Pedagogy in English Language Teaching

In the beginning, multiliteracies are known only by the term literacy, it is tools that can be used to work with and communicate information. In line with the times, this term continues to evolve according to certain fields of science and in its last development synergizes with the advancement of information technology and communication so formed the term ¹Multiliteracies. Cope and Kalantzis (2005) as a preliminary originator of the term stated that the use of the term multiliteracies is based on two arguments that are closely related to culture, educational institutions, and global demands. The first reason used is that communicating information can be used various media and the second reason is that the term has a very important meaning in enhancing the significance of language and culture for the development of one's capabilities. As such, multiliteracies pedagogy has a wide range of focus on language use that will depend heavily on the field of study, the effect it cultural context, as well as the social effect it generates.

Thus, the concept of the multiliteracies pedagogy above, in the further development of Morocco, et al. (2008:10) states that the skills of multiliteracies that must be mastered to be able to support and develop ¹¹the twenty-first-century competencies include reading skills in deep understanding, good writing skills to build and express meaning, accountable speaking skills, and the skill of progressing various digital media about various fields. This opinion is similar to the concept of Bianco (2000) stating that the purpose of multiliteracies pedagogy is to establish the ability of the students in terms of understanding the increasingly complex language and literacy codes; improving students' ability to use a variety of code-language mode used; and improving students' ability to understand and produce richer and more elaborate meanings as the impact of language integration with diverse cultures and diverse sciences (multicultural, multimodal, and multilingual).

¹⁰ The concept of multiliteracies pedagogy is also expressed by other members of McKee and Ogle (2005). McKee and Ogle (2005) Look to ¹⁰ve understanding about multiliteracies pedagogy, literacy at first should be seen as the ability to use reading, writing, listening, and speaking as efficiently as possible to ¹⁰prove thinking and communicating skills. Further, this definition is expanded by the ability to criticize, analyze, and evaluate information from various sources in a wide range of disciplines (Pullen and Cole, 2010). This is in line with Ivanic ⁹(2009) stating that Multiliteracies pedagogy is the process of giving students challenges to study and apply practical literacy that serves as a mediation tool to learn the concepts of cross-curriculum.

In line with the above description, multiliteracies pedagogy can be defined as an education model that optimizes multiliteracy skills in realizing the scientific learning situation. This study is oriented towards the development and use of the four twenty-first-century competencies namely critical thinking competencies, conceptual understanding competencies, collaborative and communicative competencies, and creative thinking competencies. The skills used to support these four competencies are reading, writing, speaking, information, and communication media mastery skills (Abidin, et al., 2015).

Critical Thinking Skills in Multiliteracies

¹² enhance the competence of the twenty-first century, in particular, the high-level thinking skills that include: critical thinking, problem-solving, creativity, and metacognitive on higher education levels in Indonesia. Based on that, the pedagogy of

multiliteracies is one of the concepts of education (theoretical) which has been proven to be an educational idea that can advance the skills of twenty-first-century thinking.

In terminology terms, at the beginning multiliteracies are only acknowledged by the term literation, for example; tools that can be used to work with and speak information. In line with the times, this term continues to evolve according to sure fields of science and in its ultimate improvement synergies with the advancement of information technological know-how and communication so formed the term multiliteracies. Cope and Kalantzis (2005) as a preliminary originator of the term stated that the use of the term multiliteracies is based on two arguments that are carefully related to culture, education, institutions, and world demands. The first cause used is that communicating facts can be used several media and the second cause is that the period has a very essential that means in enhancing the significance of language and culture for the development of one's capabilities. Thus, multiliteracies pedagogy has a various focus on the use of languages that will rely heavily on the field of study, the impact it cultural context, as well as the social outcomes it generates.

In line with the idea of multiliteracies pedagogy above, in the further development of Morocco, et., al. (2008:10) states that multiliteracies skills to be mastered to guide and advance twenty-first-century knowledge encompass deep appreciation studying skills, properly writing skills for building and expressing meaning, accountable speaking skills, and the skill of progressing a range of digital media about a number fields of science. This opinion is similar to the concept of Bianco (2000) declaring that the purpose of multiliteracies pedagogy is to structure the students' ability in terms of perception the increasingly complicated language and literacy codes; Improve college students' ability to use a variety of code-language mode codes used; and enhance students' ability to apprehend and produce richer and extra elaborate meanings as the impact of language integration with diverse cultures and various sciences (multicultural, multimodal, and multilingual).

The concept of multiliteracies pedagogy is additionally expressed using other individuals of McKee and Ogle (2005). McKee and Ogle (2005) Look to give perception about multiliteracies pedagogy, literacy, in the beginning, be viewed as the capability to use reading, writing, listening, and speaking as effectively as possible to improve thinking and communicating skills. Furthermore, this definition is accelerated by critical skills, analyzes, and considers information from more than a few sources in an extensive vary of disciplines (Pullen and Cole, 2010). This opinion is in line with Ivanic (2009) declaring that Multiliteracies pedagogy is the process of challenging students to evaluate and implement practical literacy that serves as a mediation tool to study the standards of cross-curriculum.

In line with the above description, multiliteracies pedagogy can be described as an educational model that optimizes multiliteracies capabilities in realizing scientific studying situations. This learning is oriented in the direction of the development and use of the four twenty-first-century competencies specifically critical thinking competencies, conceptual perception competencies, collaborative and communicative competencies, and creative thinking competencies. The capabilities used to help these four skills are

reading skills, writing skills, talking skills, facts, and verbal exchange media mastery capabilities (Abidin, et al., 2015).

The success of this study is in line with more than a few efforts to implement multiliteracies pedagogy ideas that have been completed through a range of study each in part and together reviewing a variety of dimensions of Multiliteracies pedagogy. A partial study capability that the writer solely learns about one dimension of Multiliteracies pedagogy in each dimension of pedagogical theory, the learning dimension, the dimensions of the teaching materials, or the contrast dimensions. But it is no longer touching on the degree of human dimensions which one of them is the dimension of socio-cultural as part of the critical structure of academic development that is oriented to the effort in creating the competency of the twenty-first century in ELT.

Based on the results of the study that has been done, the success of this study is in line with a partial study on the concept of multiliteracies pedagogy, one of them is carried out by Cope and Kalantzis (2005) which produce pedagogic model multiliteracies which is a pedagogical design consisting of four vital aspects masking the sensible situation, systematic learning, critical frame, and practical transformation that proved capable to improve.

Besides, it is argued that it is based totally on the reality that the development of the concept of schooling is nonetheless partially, and has now not been able to accommodate a distinction that is a necessity, be it the character and background of the pupil culture. Therefore, pedagogic multiliteracies are the reply to the needs of education today, mainly in the twenty-first century and in the context in Indonesia.

Conclusion

The writer concludes about some of the essential things in the multiliteracies pedagogy, namely that the components of multiliteracies pedagogy include: *situated practice, overt instruction, critical framing, transformed practice*. Also, *the implementation of multiliteracies pedagogy has better in improving the ability of students' critical thinking and problem-solving*. This signifies that multiliteracies pedagogy is one of the alternative learning models that can improve critical thinking and problem-solving students in the university effectively in the areas of study taught compared to the most direct models used in English Language Teaching (ELT). Therefore, it is advisable to implement multiliteracies pedagogy in the practice of learning activities. Also, the application of multiliteracies pedagogy should be supported by the cooperation of all elements, both between teachers, management, and parents. This needs to be done to realize the effectiveness of quality learning, thus giving implications on the growth of potential students.

References

- Anstey, M., & Bull, G. (2010). Helping teachers to explore multimodal texts. *Curriculum & Leadership Journal*, 8(16). Retrieved from http://www.curriculum.edu.au/leader/helping_teachers_to_explore_multimodal_texts,31522.html?issueID=12141
- Abidin, Y., Mulyati, T., Yunansah, H. (2015). *Pembelajaran Literasi dalam konteks Pendidikan Multiterasi Integratif, dan Berdiferensiasi*. Bandung: Rizqy Press
- Bianco, J.L. (2000). "Multiliteracies and Multilingualism" in *Multiliteracies: Literacy Learning and the Design of Social Futures*. New York: Routledge.

- Cope, B. and Kalantzis, M. (2005). *Multiliteracies: Literacy Learning and the Design of Social Futures*. New York: Routledge
- Cromwell, L. (1992). *Teaching Critical Thinking in the Arts and Humanities*. Milwaukee: Alverno Productions.
- Clark, V.P. & Creswell, J.W., (2010). *Understanding research: A Consumer's guide*, (pp. 118 – 120), Upper Saddle Ridge, NJ, Pearson Education
- Dardjowidjojo, S. (1997). *Cultural Constraints in the Teaching of English in Indonesia*. Paper presented at the TEFLIN 45th National Conference, 4-6 August 1997. Maranatha Christian University, Bandung.
- Freire, P. (2008). *Pendidikan Kaum tertindas*. Jakarta: Pustaka LP3S Indonesia.
- Ivanic, R. (2009). "Bringing Literacy Studies into Research and Prospects" in *The Future of Literacy Studies*. New York: Palgrave MacMillan
- Kalantzis, Mary and William Cope (2008). *Language Education and Multiliteracies*. DOI: [10.1007/978-0-387-30424-3](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-0-387-30424-3). In book: *Encyclopedia of Language and Education* (pp.209-226). Publisher: Springer. Editors: N. Van Deusen-Scholl, N. Hornberge
- Mills, K. A. (2006). *Critical framing in the pedagogy of multiliteracies*. In *Proceedings Australian Literacy Educator's Association/Australian Association of the Teaching of English National Conference 2006: Voices, Vibes, Visions*, Darwin
- Marcellino, M. (2008). *English Language Teaching in Indonesia: A Continuous Challenge in Education and Cultural Diversity*. *TEFLIN Journal*, 19(1):57-69.
- Masduqi, H. (2008). *The Integration of English Skills into One Lesson*. Paper presented at the National Linguistics Seminar at Brawijaya University, Malang.
- _____. (2011). *Critical Thinking Skills and Meaning In English Language Teaching*. In the *6 TEFLIN Journal*, Volume 22, Number 2, July 2011
- McKee, J. & Ogle, D. (2005). *Integrating Instruction: Literacy and Science. Tools for Teaching Literacy Series*. Guilford Publications
- Marlina, Robby & R.A. Giri (2014). *The Pedagogy of English as an International Language (EIL): More Reflections and Dialogue*. *The Pedagogy of English as an International Language: Perspectives from Scholars, Teachers, and Students*, *English Language Education 1*, DOI [10.1007/978-3-319-06127-6_1](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-06127-6_1), © Springer International Publishing Switzerland.
- Morocco, C.C., et al. (2008). *Supported Literacy for Adolescents: Transforming Teaching and Content Learning for The TwentyFirst Century*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass A Wiley Imprint
- Pullen, D.L. and Cole, D.R. (2010). *Multiliteracies and Technology Enhanced Education: Social Practice and the Global Classroom*. New York: Information Science Reference
- Richards, J.C., & Rodgers, T.S. (2001). *Communicative Language Teaching*. In *Approaches and Methods in Language Teaching*. (2nd Edition). New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Sukono. (2004). *Is CLT a Thing of the Past?* Unpublished article. Melbourne: Monash University.
- Untari, Esti (2017). *The importance of multiliteracies for students of primary school teachers in preparation of curriculum 2013*. *Wahana Sekolah Dasar (Kajian Teori dan Praktik Pendidikan)* Tahun 25, Nomor 1, Januari 2017.
- Yusny, Rahmat. (2013). *ELT in Indonesia Context: Issues and Challenges*. *Englisia* November 2013 VOL. 1 NO.1, 81-99

Innovation in ELT: Multiliteracies Pedagogy for Enhancing Critical Thinking Skills in the 21st Century

ORIGINALITY REPORT

14%

SIMILARITY INDEX

12%

INTERNET SOURCES

2%

PUBLICATIONS

5%

STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	repository.usd.ac.id Internet Source	3%
2	Submitted to Universitas Negeri Surabaya The State University of Surabaya Student Paper	2%
3	123dok.com Internet Source	2%
4	e-prosiding.poliban.ac.id Internet Source	2%
5	mafiadoc.com Internet Source	1%
6	www.semanticscholar.org Internet Source	1%
7	Najamuddin Petta Solong, Ahmad Fakhurrazi Mohammed Zabidi, Ni'ma M. Alhabsyi. "Professional Competence of Islamic Religious Education Teachers to Improve Students' Mastery of Learning Materials", Indonesian	1%

Journal of Islamic Education Studies (IJIES), 2023

Publication

8	Submitted to Segi University College Student Paper	1 %
9	e-journal.adpgmiindonesia.com Internet Source	1 %
10	Marisa T. Cohen. "The Importance of Vocabulary for Science Learning", Kappa Delta Pi Record, 2012 Publication	1 %
11	download.atlantis-press.com Internet Source	1 %
12	vdocuments.site Internet Source	1 %

Exclude quotes On

Exclude matches < 1%

Exclude bibliography On